



Creating savings and efficiencies: procurement collaboration in practice

The complex procurement for the Designed for Life: Building for Wales 2 framework project provided the perfect opportunity to realise all the benefits of the xchangewales electronic tools and services, including cost, efficiency and sustainability savings. As a direct result of using the electronic tendering tool, eTenderWales, and the evaluation tool, AWARD, the NHS Shared Services Partnership Facilities Team estimate that they have saved over £98,000 in postage and administration time, and over £15,000 in travel and expenses costs.

Learning from past procurements

When NHS Shared Service Partnership – Facilities Services commenced the Designed for Life: Building for Wales 2 framework in 2010, the team knew that following the process and methods of the original framework would not be feasible. The procurement had generated a high levels of interest and in turn this generated a vast amount of tender documentation – almost ten boxes of paper per supplier submission – and with this intense levels of resource in both managing the project and also evaluation.

The Welsh Government xchangewales programme promotes the use of, and provides access to, electronic procurement tool. The eSourcing tools provided through the programme by partner service providers BravoSolution and QinetiQ Commerce Decisions offered the solution that the Facilities Services procurement team were looking for.

About Facilities Services and the Designed for Life: Building for Wales frameworks

Facilities Services (formerly Welsh Health Estates) acts as the Welsh Government agent establishing and maintaining construction frameworks for capital development in Health.

Use of the centrally procured frameworks by the Welsh NHS Health Boards and Trusts is mandatory for all projects with a construction cost in excess of £4million.

The Designed for Life Building for Wales 1 construction framework, which commenced in June 2006, had a capital budget of circa £1.2billion. The framework concluded in June 2012 and is replaced by Designed for Life 2.

The objectives of the frameworks are to:

- Obtain best value for money in major health capital developments
- Implement the Welsh Government's construction policy and ensure the NHS in Wales complies with best practice models of procurement based on long term partnerships
- Ensure NHS Wales is an exemplar client for all major construction procurement projects
- Create an environment of collaborative working and continuous improvement, utilising strategic partnerships with integrated supply chains.

BravoSolution's eTenderWales tool would provide a robust, secure online tool to manage the tender process, whilst QinetiQ's AWARD would support the complex evaluation process. Both these tools supported the removal of paper production in the tender and evaluation process but also fulfilled a number of other obligations the team had to satisfy:

- Ensure the tender and evaluation services were fully compliant and auditable in order to support and withstand any legal challenge and Freedom of Information requests. A number of court cases in Northern Ireland relating to frameworks made this particularly salient
- Reduce internal resource pressures that could arise due to the increase from 4 to 18 Lots and the maintenance of the existing framework during the procurement process
- Support and manage the level and volume of communications between Facilities Services and the private sector.

The team were further assured that the eTender and eEvaluation tools were appropriate by the experiences of their English counterparts who had benefited from their use in their Procure 21 procurement exercise.

Creating valuable efficiencies in the tender process

The team anticipated that the advertisement of the frameworks (through the Welsh National Procurement Site 'Sell2Wales' and in the Official Journal of European Union (OJEU)) would generate expressions of interest from a large volume of suppliers. In fact, the response generated was so unprecedented that amendments to the Sell2Wales operating system were made to support the initial volume of messages to registered suppliers. This ensured that questions were answered efficiently and responses automated wherever possible.

With the support of the eTender tool a structured three stage process was adopted to guide suppliers through completion and mandatory questions to

ensure submissions were complete, and importantly they were able to deselect themselves preventing wasted time and effort from both sides.

Stage 1 – Sufficient information was captured in the Memorandum of Information enabling suppliers not suitable to eliminate themselves.

Stage 2 – A series of pass / fail questions with a mandatory 100% pass rate to identify those capable financially and in terms of capacity.

Stage 3 – A technical questionnaire with responses limited to 4000 characters by the system – focusing the suppliers' answers and making the process more efficient for the evaluators. Suppliers meeting the outlined standards and scoring would then reach the shortlist for the Invitation to Tender (ITT) stage.

A paper process would have resulted in huge numbers and volumes of documents being produced and delivered to suppliers unable to fulfil the PQQ criteria. Using the BravoSolution eTender tool ensured that no paper was produced, a robust elimination process could be applied, and response length was reduced.

366 suppliers expressed an interest in the framework, out of which 105 responded to the PQQ. With an average of around 29% PQQ return rate on expressions of interest, the electronic process did not waste any paper or resource by including the 71% who chose not to respond.

The procurement team's ability to communicate in a timely and efficient manner was also greatly enhanced by using the eTender tool. They were able to establish a single point for all data and documents, provide parity of tender information to all candidates through the ability to disseminate information to all at the same time and importantly handle the vast volumes of messages whilst maintaining appropriate audit trails. In fact, during the PQQ and ITT stages, the team handled a total of 697 messages from suppliers and sent a staggering 23,207 messages out.

With the whole process captured in one system the entire team had visibility and there was more inclusive engagement with stakeholders, encouraging increased ownership and contribution. Using the tool also introduced greater flexibility for those who needed to work remotely or were geographically displaced.

Using AWARD to optimise the evaluation stage

The use of QinetiQ Commerce Decisions' AWARD tool was particularly valuable for those geographically displaced from the Facilities Services team in Llanishen. The 48 evaluators came from three regions in Wales and being able to work remotely eliminated the need, supported sustainability targets and also reduced associated costs. This remote flexibility also greatly assisted the evaluators who could manage their time more effectively, whilst maintaining input to their 'day jobs'.

Evaluators were provided with an online workbook that contained all the information they needed about suppliers and the questions they would need to evaluate. During evaluation, the procurement team was able to monitor progress in real time, run progress reports and carry out consistency checks across the scoring through the process of moderation, thus reducing the risk of challenge later on.

Stronger emphasis on the importance of entering thorough and good quality rationale minimised the need for extensive checking and moderation of

evaluator scores. In fact, following a review of the score rationale provided by evaluators for this tender, the NHS Wales Shared Services Partnership Financial Services division agreed the input of comments by evaluators will no longer be a mandatory action during the PQQ evaluation in future frameworks. This is due to the strength of the level and standard of the pre-prepared model answers in Design for Life 2. Instead, evaluators will be advised that they need only input comments / observations for exceptional cases.

The quality and level of detail delivered in debrief reports was praised by suppliers – this was especially useful in face to face meetings where the team were able to draw from response data, scoring criteria, final evaluation scores and evaluator rationale. All this information was pulled down from AWARD through standard reporting.

So what about efficiency and cost savings directly attributable to the adoption of electronic tendering for this procurement?

The Facilities Services team has been delighted with the savings they have made for this procurement – in particular in areas where historically costs are high during the evaluation phase. For example, through the use of Award 48 evaluators were able to access bids from their office bases and the need for central meetings was eliminated. Through travel time savings, mileage costs and time spend in meetings, it is estimated that approximately **£15,000** was saved on this element of the process alone.

Efficiencies were also realised by utilising the eTendering message and response system: 23,000 messages were issued at PQQ stage and 6,000 messages at ITT stage. Previously, each communication would have been issued to individual suppliers in the form of a letter. The robust audit trail provided by eTenderwales and the ability to issue a single message to any number of involved suppliers confidentially, resulted in huge manual process savings. These have been estimated at just under **£100,000**.

The tables below describe savings and benefits for the 6 procurement processes run for all specialisms. These are based on the Value Wales Benefits Calculator.

Cost Savings

Process efficiency saving (per tender)	Direct cost reduction (per tender)	Calculated savings from process efficiencies	Calculated savings from direct cost reductions
£2,143	£417	£12,858	£2,502

Sustainability Savings

Average number of pages (per tender)	Average reduction in printed paper (A4)	Estimated number of trees saved
46,440	27,894	30.27

The total estimated saving achieved through the use of eTenderwales and Award for all aspects covered above is approximately **£130,000**.

What's next for Facilities Services?

Design for Life Build for Wales 3 commenced in December 2011. These experiences and benefits of using electronic procurement means that the team look forward to using both eTenderWales and AWARD, incorporating many of the lessons learnt from the previous procurement.



DESIGNED FOR *Life*: BUILDING FOR *Wales 2*
CYNLLUN *Oes*: ADEILADU AR GYFER *Cymru 2*



Creu arbedion ac arbedion effeithlonrwydd: yr arfer o gydweithio wrth gaffael

Rhoddodd y gwaith caffael cymhleth ar gyfer prosiect fframwaith Cynllun Oes: Adeiladu ar gyfer Cymru 2, gyfle perffaith i fanteisio ar holl arfau a gwasanaethau cyfnewidcymru, gan gynnwys cost, effeithlonrwydd ac arbedion cynladwyedd. O ganlyniad uniongyrchol i ddefnyddio'r arf tendro electronig, eTendroCymru, a'r arf gwerthuso, AWARD, mae Tîm Partneriaeth Cyfleusterau Gwasanaethau a Rennir y GIG yn amcangyfrif eu bod wedi arbed dros £98,000 mewn costau postio ac amser gweinyddu, a thros £15,000 ar yr deithio a chostau teithio.

Dysgu o waith caffael y gorffennol

Pan gychwynnodd Gwasanaeth Cyfleusterau – Partneriaeth Gwasanaethau a Rennir y GIG ar fframwaith Cynllun Oes: Adeiladu ar gyfer Cymru 2 yn 2010, gwyddai'r tîm na fyddai dilyn proses a dulliau'r fframwaith gwreiddiol yn bosibl. Roedd y gwaith caffael wedi creu lefelu uchel o ddiddordeb ac yn ei dro, swm mawr o ddogfennau tendro – bron i ddeg blwch o bapur i bob cyflenwr oedd yn cyflwyno cais – a chyda hyn, lefelau dwys o adnoddau i reoli'r prosiect a'r gwerthuso hefyd.

Mae rhaglen cyfnewidcymru Llywodraeth Cymru yn hyrwyddo defnyddio arf caffael electronig, ac yn rhoi mynediad ato hefyd. Roedd yr arfau eGyrchu a ddarperir drwy'r rhaglen gan y darparwyr partner BravoSolution a QinetiQ Commerce Decisions, yn cynnig yr ateb yr oedd tîm caffael y Gwasanaethau Cyfleusterau'n chwilio amdano.

Am Wasanaethau Cyfleusterau a Cynllun Oes: Fframwaith Adeiladu ar gyfer Cymru

Gwasanaethau cyfleusterau (ynghynt Ystadau Iechyd Cymru) yn gweithredu fel asiant Llywodraeth Cymru, yn sefydlu a chynnal fframweithiau adeiladu ar gyfer datblygu cyfalaf mewn iechyd.

Mae defnydd o'r fframweithiau caffael canolog gan y Byrddau Iechyd GIG Cymru ac Ymddiriedolaethau yn orfodol ar gyfer pob prosiect gyda cost adeiladu o dros £4miliwn.

Mae'r fframwaith adeiladu Cynllun Oes, Adeiladu ar gyfer Cymru 1, a ddechreuodd yn Mehefin 2006 a chyllideb cyfalaf o tua £1.2biliwn. Daeth y fframwaith i'r casgliad yn Mehefin 2012 ac yn cael ei ddisodli gan Cynllun Oes 2.

Amcanion y fframweithiau yw:

- Sicrhau gwerth gorau am arian yn y prif datblygiadau iechyd cyfalaf
- Gweithredu polisi adeiladu Llywodraeth Cymru a sicrhau bod y GIG yn Cymru yn cydymffurfio gyda modelau arfer gorau caffael yn seiliedig ar partneriaethau tymor hir
- Sicrhau bod GIG Cymru yn gleient enghreifftiol ar gyfer holl gaffael prosiectau adeiladu mawr
- Creu amgylchedd o gydweithio a gwelliant parhaus, defnyddio partneriaethau strategol drwy integreiddio cadwyni cyflenwi.

Byddai arf eTendroCymru BravoSolution yn cynnig arf ar-lein cadarn, diogel i reoli'r broses dendro, a byddai AWARD QinetiQ yn cefnogi'r broses werthuso gymhleth. Roedd y ddau arf yma'n cefnogi cael gwared ar gynhyrchu papur yn y broses dendro a gwerthuso, ond roedd hefyd yn ateb nifer o'r gofynion eraill yr oedd yn rhaid i'r tîm eu bodloni:

- Sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau tendro a gwerthuso yn cydymffurfio'n llawn ac y gellid eu harchwilio er mwyn cefnogi a gwrthsefyll unrhyw sialens gyfreithiol a cheisiadau Rhyddid Gwybodaeth. Daeth sawl achos llys yng Ngogledd Iwerddon ynglŷn â fframweithiau â hyn i'r amlwg
- Lleihau'r pwysau ar adnoddau mewnol allai godi yn sgil y cynnydd o 4 i 18 o Lotiau a chynnal y fframwaith cyfredol yn ystod y broses gaffael
- Cynnal a rheoli lefel a swm y cyfathrebu rhwng y Gwasanaethau Cyfleusterau a'r sector preifat.

Cafodd y tîm sicrwydd pellach bod yr arfau eDendro ac eWerthuso yn briodol yn ôl profiadau eu cydweithwyr yn Lloegr, oedd wedi manteisio ar eu defnyddio yn eu hymarfer caffael Caffael 21.

Creu arbedion effeithlonrwydd gwerthfawr yn y broses dendro

Roedd y tîm yn rhagweld y byddai hysbysebu'r fframwaith (drwy Safle Caffael Cenedlaethol Cymru 'GwerthwchiGymru' ac yng Nghyfnodolyn Swyddogol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn cynhyrchu diddordeb gan nifer fawr o gyflenwyr. Mewn gwirionedd, roedd yr ymateb a gafwyd heb ei debyg, a bu'n rhaid gwneud newidiadau i system weithredu GwerthwchiGymru er mwyn cynnal nifer y negeseuon cychwynnol i gyflenwyr cofrestredig. Roedd hyn yn sicrhau bod cwestiynau wedi eu hateb yn effeithlon a bod ymatebion wedi eu cynhyrchu lle bynnag yr oedd modd.

Gyda chefnogaeth arf eDendro, mabwysiadwyd proses strwythuredig yn cynnwys tri cham i dywys cyflenwyr drwy'r gwaith o'i lenwi a chwestiynau statudol, er mwyn sicrhau bod y ceisiadau a gyflwynwyd yn gyflawn, ac yn bwysig iawn, roeddent

yn gallu eu dad-ddewis eu hunain gan arbed gwastraffu amser ac ymdrech ar y ddwy ochr.

Cam 1 – Cynhwyswyd digon o wybodaeth yn y Memorandwm Gwybodaeth er mwyn galluogi cyflenwyr anaddas i'w dileu eu hunain.

Cam 2 – Cyfres o gwestiynau llwyddo / methu gyda chyfradd llwyddo 100% gorfodol er mwyn nodi'r rhai sy'n gymwys yn ariannol ac o ran gallu.

Cam 3 – Holiadur technegol gydag ymatebion wedi eu cyfyngu i 4000 cymeriad gan y system – gan roi ffocws i atebion y cyflenwyr a gwneud y broses yn fwy effeithlon i'r gwerthuswyr. Byddai'r cyflenwyr oedd yn bodloni'r safonau a'r sgoriau a amlinellwyd wedyn yn cyrraedd y rhestr fer ar gyfer y cam Gwahoddiad i Dendro.

Byddai proses ar bapur wedi arwain at niferoedd uchel a chyfrolau o ddogfennau'n cael eu cynhyrchu a'u cyflwyno i gyflenwyr fyddai'n anaddas i gyflenwi meini prawf yr Holiadur Cyn-Gymhwyso. Roedd defnyddio'r arf eDendro BravoSolution yn sicrhau nad oedd papur yn cael ei gynhyrchu, y gellid defnyddio proses ddileu gadarn, a bod hyd yr ymateb wedi ei leihau.

Wnaeth 366 o gyflenwyr mynegi diddordeb yn y fframwaith, gyda 105 allan o hynny wedi ymateb i'r holiadur cyn-gymhwyso. Gyda cyfartaledd o tua 29% cyfradd dychwelyd holiadur cyn-gymhwyso, ni wastraffodd y broses electronig unrhyw bapur neu adnoddau gan gynnwys y 71% a ddewisodd i beidio ymateb.

Roedd gallu'r tîm caffael i gyfathrebu mewn modd amserol ac effeithlon wedi ei wella'n fawr hefyd gan ddefnyddio'r arf eDendro. Roeddent yn gallu sefydlu un man ar gyfer yr holl ddata a dogfennau, darparu gwybodaeth dendro gydradd i'r ymgeiswyr i gyd drwy'r gallu i ledaenu gwybodaeth i bawb ar yr un pryd, ac yn bwysig iawn, ymdrin â'r nifer helaeth o negeseuon a chadw llwybrau archwilio priodol ar yr un pryd. Yn wir, yn ystod camau'r Holiadur Cyn-Gymhwyso a'r Gwahoddiad i Dendro, ymdriniodd y tîm a chyfanswm o 697 o negeseuon gan gyflenwyr ac anfonwyd swm anhygoel o 23,207 o negeseuon allan.

Gan fod y broses gyfan wedi ei dal mewn un system, roedd popeth yn weladwy i'r tîm cyfan ac roedd mwy o ymwneud cynhwysol gyda rhanddeiliaid, gan annog rhagor o berchnogaeth a chyfraniad. Drwy ddefnyddio'r arf, llwyddwyd hefyd i ddod a mwy o hyblygrwydd i'r rhai oedd angen gweithio o bell neu oedd wedi eu dadleoli'n ddaearyddol.

Defnyddio AWARD i wneud y mwyaf o'r cam gwerthuso

Roedd defnyddio arf AWARD QinetiQ Commerce Decisions yn hynod werthfawr i'r rhai oedd wedi eu dadleoli'n ddaearyddol oddi wrth dîm y Gwasanaethau Cyfleusterau yn Llanisien. Daeth y 48 gwerthuswr o dri rhanbarth yng Nghymru ac roedd gallu gweithio o bell yn dileu'r angen, yn cefnogi targedau cynladwyedd a hefyd yn lleihau'r costau ynglŷn â hynny. Roedd yr hyblygrwydd hwn o bell yn gymorth mawr i'r gwerthuswyr hefyd, oherwydd y gallent reoli eu hamser yn fwy effeithiol, gan gynnal y mewnbwn i'w 'gwaith bob dydd'.

Cafodd y gwerthuswyr lyfr gwaith ar-lein oedd yn cynnwys yr holl wybodaeth oedd ei angen arnynt am y cyflenwyr a'r cwestiynau y byddai'n rhaid iddynt eu gwerthuso. Yn ystod y gwerthuso, llwyddodd y tîm caffael i fonitro cynnydd mewn amser real, cynnal adroddiadau cynnydd a gwirio cysondeb ar draws y sgorio drwy broses safoni, a thrwy hynny leihau'r perygl o herio yn nes ymlaen.

Roedd pwyslais cryfach ar bwysigrwydd cyflwyno rhesymwaith trylwyr ac o ansawdd da, yn lleihau'r

angen am wirio helaeth a safoni sgoriau gwerthuswyr. Yn wir, yn dilyn adolygiad o'r rhesymwaith sgôr a ddarparwyd gan y gwerthuswyr ar gyfer y tendr hwn, cytunodd Gwasanaethau Ariannol Partneriaeth Gwasanaethau a Rennir yng Nghymru, na fydd mewnbwn y sylwadau gan werthuswyr bellach yn gamau gorfodol yn ystod gwerthuso'r Holiadur Cyn-Gymhwyso yn fframweithiau'r dyfodol. Mae hyn o herwydd cryfder lefel a safon yr atebion model a baratowyd ymlaen llaw yng Nghynllun Oes 2. Yn hytrach, cynghorir gwerthuswyr mai dim ond sylwadau mewnbwn /arsylwadau ar gyfer achosion eithriadol sydd eu hangen arnynt yn unig.

Canmolwyd ansawdd a lefel y manylder a gyflwynwyd mewn adroddiadau ôl-drafod gan gyflenwyr – roedd hyn yn arbennig o ddefnyddiol mewn cyfarfodydd wyneb yn wyneb lle'r oedd y tîm yn gallu tynnu ar ddata ymateb, meini prawf cyrchu, sgoriau gwerthuso terfynol a rhesymwaith gwerthuso. Tynnwyd yr wybodaeth hon i gyd o AWARD drwy adrodd safonol.

Felly beth am arbed costau ac arbedion effeithlonrwydd y sy'n deillio'n uniongyrchol o fabwysiadu tendro electronig ar gyfer y caffael hwn?

Mae'r tîm Cyfleusterau wedi bod yn falch iawn o'r arbedion y maen nhw wedi eu gwneud ar gyfer y caffael hwn – yn enwedig mewn meysydd lle mae hanes bod y costau yn uchel yn ystod y cyfnod gwerthuso. Er enghraifft, drwy ddefnyddio Award, llwyddodd 48 o werthuswyr i gael mynediad at y ceisiadau o leoliadau eu swyddfa a dilëwyd yr angen am gyfarfodydd canolog. Drwy arbed ar amser teithio, costau fesul milltir a'r amser a dreulwyd mewn cyfarfodydd, amcangyfrifir bod oddeutu **£15,000** wedi ei arbed ar yr elfen hon o'r broses yn unig.

Gwnaed arbedion hefyd drwy ddefnyddio system neges ac ymateb eDendro: anfonwyd 23,000 o negeseuon yn y cam Holiadur Cyn Cymhwyso a 6,000 o negeseuon yn y cam Gwahoddiad i Dendro.

Cynt, byddai pob neges wedi ei hanfon at gyflenwyr unigol ar ffurf llythyr. Fe arweiniodd y llwybr archwilio cadarn a ddarparwyd gan eDendroCymru a'r gallu i anfon neges unigol yn gyfrinachol at unrhyw nifer o gyflenwyr oedd yn rhan o'r broses, at arbedion enfawr yn y broses bapur. Mae'r rhain wedi eu hamcangyfrif ar ychydig llai na **£100,000**.

Mae'r tablau isod yn disgrifio'r arbedion a'r manteision ar gyfer y 6 phroses gaffael a gynhaliwyd ar gyfer pob arbenigedd. Mae'r rhain wedi eu seilio ar Gyfrifiannell Manteision Gwerthi Gymru.

Arbed Costau

Arbedion effeithlonrwydd prosesau (i bob tendr)	Gostynnngiad cost uniongyrchol (i bob tendr)	Arbedion a gyfrifwyd o effeithlonrwydd prosesau	Arbedion a gyfrifwyd o ostyngiadau cost uniongyrchol
£2,143	£417	£12,858	£2,502

Arbedion Cynladwyeddd

Nifer cyfartalog y tudalennau (i bob tendr)	Gostyngiad cyfartalog mewn papur a (A4)	Amcan nifer y coed a arbedwyd
46,440	27,894	30.27

Mae cyfanswm amcangyfrif o'r arbedion a wnaed drwy ddefnyddio eDendroCymru ac Award ar gyfer pob agwedd a drafodwyd uchod yn oddeutu **£130,000**.

Beth nesaf ar gyfer y Gwasanaethau Cyfleusterau?

Cychwynnodd Cynllun Oes Adeiladu ar gyfer Cymru 3 ym mis Rhagfyr 2011. Mae'r profiadau a'r manteision hyn o ddefnyddio dulliau caffael electronig yn golygu bod y tîm yn edrych ymlaen at ddefnyddio eDendroCymru ac AWARD, gan ymgorffori nifer o'r gwersi a ddysgwyd o gaffael blaenorol.



DESIGNED FOR *Life*: BUILDING FOR *Wales 2*
CYNLLUN Oes: ADEILADU AR GYFER *Cymru 2*